# Supercomputing the Universe

# Joel R. Primack



# VOYAGE TO THE VIRGO CLUSTER



## VOYAGE TO THE VIRGO CLUSTER

## **Cosmological Simulations**

Astronomical observations represent snapshots of moments in time. It is the role of astrophysical theory to produce movies -- both metaphorical and actual -- that link these snapshots together into a coherent physical theory.

**Cosmological dark matter simulations show** large scale structure, growth of structure, and dark matter halo properties

Hydrodynamic galaxy formation simulations: evolution of galaxies, formation of galactic spheroids via mergers, galaxy images in all wavebands including stellar evolution and dust



#### dark matter simulation - expanding with the universe





#### same simulation - not showing expansion



Billions of years after the Big Bang

Andrey Kravtsov

#### CONSTRAINED LOCAL UNIVERSE SIMULATION





#### z=49.000



Expanding Simulation - Ben Moore et al. Music: L. Subramanian & Stephane Grapelli "French Resolution" album *Conversations* 

## Expansion....

z=49.00 t=49 Myr

![](_page_11_Picture_2.jpeg)

#### z=0.837 t= 6.66 Gyr

#### End of expansion for this halo

z= 0.000 t= 13.7 Gyr (today) Wild Space

> Tame Space

#### Aquarius Simulation Volker Springel

#### Milky Way 100,000 Light Years

![](_page_13_Picture_2.jpeg)

Milky Way Dark Matter Halo 1,500,000 Light Years

![](_page_14_Picture_0.jpeg)

## Bolshoi Cosmological Simulation

Anatoly Klypin & Joel Primack NASA Ames Research Center 8.6x10<sup>8</sup> particles I kpc resolution

#### I Billion Light Years

#### Bolshoi Cosmological Simulation

#### 100 Million Light Years

![](_page_16_Picture_2.jpeg)

#### I Billion Light Years

#### Bolshoi Cosmological Simulation

Bolshoi Simulation - Anatoly Klypin & Joel Primack 100 Million Lization Christopher Henze, NASA Music: Ray Lynch "Her Knees Deep in My Mind" album Nothing Above My Head But the Evening

#### How the Halo of the Big Cluster Formed

![](_page_18_Picture_1.jpeg)

#### How the Halo of the Big Cluster Formed Merger Tree (History) of All the Halos that Have Fallen in by Today

Time: 13664 Myr Ago Timestep Redshift: 14.083 Radius Mode: Rvir Focus Distance: 6.1 Aperture: 40.0 World Rotation: (216.7, 0.06, -0.94, -0.34) Trackball Rotation: (0.0, 0.00, 0.00, 0.00) Camera Position: (0.0, 0.0, -6.1)

Peter Behroozi

## Bjork "Dark Matter" Biophilia

![](_page_20_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_21_Picture_0.jpeg)

#### *IEEE Spectrum* - October 2012

#### 500 Million Years After the Big Bang

![](_page_22_Picture_2.jpeg)

#### THE UNIVERSE IN A SUPERCOMPUTER

#### **6 Billion Years**

![](_page_22_Picture_5.jpeg)

**COSMIC WEB:** The Bolshoi simulation models the evolution of dark matter, which is responsible for the largescale structure of the universe. Here, snapshots from the simulation show the dark matter distribution at 500 million and 2.2 billion years [top] and 6 billion and 13.7 billion years [bottom] after the big bang. These images are 50-million-light-year-thick slices of a cube of simulated universe that today would measure roughly 1 billion light-years on a side and encompass about 100 galaxy clusters.

VISUALIZATION, STEFAN GOTTLÖBER/LEIBNIZ INSTITUTE FOR ASTROPHYSICS POTSDAM

#### To understand the cosmos, we must evolve it all over again By Joel R. Primack

HEN IT COMES TO RECONSTRUCTING THE PAST, you might think that astrophysicists have it easy. After all, the sky is awash with evidence. For most of the universe's history, space has been largely transparent, so much so that light emitted by distant galaxies can travel for billions of years before finally reaching Earth. It might seem that all researchers have to do to find out what the universe looked like, say, 10 billion years ago is to build a telescope sensitive enough to pick up that ancient light.

Actually, it's more complicated than that. Most of the ordinary matter in the universe—the stuff that makes up all the atoms, stars, and galaxies astronomers can see—is invisible, either sprinkled throughout intergalactic space in tenuous forms that emit and absorb little light or else swaddled inside galaxies in murky clouds of dust and gas. When astronomers look out into the night sky with their most powerful telescopes, they can see no more than about 10 percent of the ordinary matter that's out there.

To make matters worse, cosmologists have discovered that if you add up all the mass and energy in the universe, only a small fraction is composed of ordinary matter. A good 95 percent of the cosmos is made up of two very different kinds of invisible and as-yet-unidentified stuff that is "dark," meaning that it emits and absorbs no light at all. One of these mysterious components, called dark matter, seems immune to all fundamental forces except gravity and perhaps the weak interaction, which is responsible for

 $(\mathbf{D}')$ 

#### Determination of σ<sub>8</sub> and Ω<sub>M</sub> from CMB+ WMAP+SN+Clusters Planck+WP+HighL+BAO

![](_page_23_Figure_1.jpeg)

#### Bolshoi-Planck Cosmological Simulation

Anatoly Klypin & Joel Primack Now running on Pleiades computer at NASA Ames Research Center 8.6x10<sup>8</sup> particles 1 kpc resolution

#### I Billion Light Years

## **Observational Data**

#### Sloan Digital Sky Survey

## **Cosmological Simulation**

Risa Wechsler, Ralf Kahler, Nina McCurdy

![](_page_25_Figure_4.jpeg)

The Milky Way has two large satellite galaxies, the small and large Magellanic Clouds

How common is this?

The Bolshoi simulation + halo abundance matching predict the likelihood of 0, 1, 2, 3, ... large satellites

![](_page_27_Figure_0.jpeg)

No. of neighbors per galaxy

![](_page_27_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_27_Picture_3.jpeg)

![](_page_27_Figure_4.jpeg)

No. of neighbors per galaxy

#### **Statistics of MW bright satellites:**

Sloan Digital Sky Survey data vs. Bolshoi simulation

![](_page_28_Figure_2.jpeg)

# **Galaxy Formation via SemiAnalytic Models**

- gas is collisionally heated when perturbations 'turn around' and collapse to form gravitationally bound structures
- gas in halos cools via atomic line transitions (depends on density, temperature, and metallicity)
- cooled gas collapses to form a rotationally supported disk
- cold gas forms stars, with efficiency a function of gas density (e.g. Schmidt-Kennicutt Law, metallicity effects?)
- massive stars and SNe reheat (and in small halos expel) cold gas and some metals
- galaxy mergers trigger bursts of star formation; 'major' mergers transform disks into spheroids and fuel AGN
- AGN feedback cuts off star formation
- including effects of dissipation in gas-rich galaxy mergers leads to observed elliptical size-mass relation
- including spheroid formation by disk instability is essential to reproduce the observed elliptical luminosity function

White & Frenk 91; Kauffmann+93; Cole+94; Somerville & Primack 99; Cole+00; Somerville, Primack, & Faber 01; Croton et al. 2006; Somerville +08; Fanidakis+09; Covington et al. 10, 11; Somerville, Gilmore, Primack, & Dominguez 11; Porter et al.

Elliptical galaxies follow a size-mass relation. The Bolhoi semi-analytic model correctly predicts this and the other relations of elliptical galaxies. Disk galaxies follow a relation between the speed they spin and their luminosity. The theory also correctly predict this.

![](_page_30_Picture_2.jpeg)

Finally, the theory correctly predicts the numbers of Disk Galaxies and Elliptical Galaxies of all masses

## **Cosmological Simulations**

Astronomical observations represent snapshots of moments in time. It is the role of astrophysical theory to produce movies -- both metaphorical and actual -- that link these snapshots together into a coherent physical theory.

**Cosmological dark matter simulations show** large scale structure, growth of structure, and dark matter halo properties

Hydrodynamic galaxy formation simulations: evolution of galaxies, formation of galactic spheroids via mergers, galaxy images in all wavebands including stellar evolution and dust

320 крс

## How Galaxies Form

#### Gas inflows to massive halos along DM filaments

RAMSES simulation by Romain Teyssier on Mare Nostrum supercomputer, Barcelona

Dekel et al. Nature 2009

![](_page_33_Picture_0.jpeg)

• Stars

# How Gas moves and Stars form according to galaxy simulations

![](_page_33_Picture_4.jpeg)

ART Simulation Daniel Ceverino; Visualization: David Ellsworth

time=276

## Gas Density in ART Zoom-in Simulations

simulation by Daniel Ceverino et al., analyzed and visualized by Chris Moody using yt

Simulation includes gas cooling by atomic hydrogen and helium, metal and molecular hydrogen cooling, photoionization heating by a UV background with partial self-shielding, star formation, stellar mass loss, metal enrichment of the ISM, and feedback from stellar winds and supernovae. Force resolution is ~ 35-70 pc.

![](_page_34_Picture_3.jpeg)

**40 Mpc** 

![](_page_35_Picture_0.jpeg)

# Sunrise Radiative Transfer Code

For every simulation snapshot:

- Evolving stellar spectra calculation
- Adaptive grid construction
- Monte Carlo radiative transfer
- "Polychromatic" rays save 100x CPU time
- Graphic Processor Units give 10x speedup

![](_page_36_Figure_7.jpeg)

Patrik Jonsson & Joel Primack

# **Spectral Energy Distribution**

![](_page_37_Figure_1.jpeg)

In about 5 billion years, our Milky Way Galaxy will collide and merge with our neighboring giant galaxy, Andromeda.

![](_page_39_Picture_0.jpeg)

Spiral Galaxy Merger Simulation - Patrik Jonsson, Greg Novak, Joel Primack Music: Nancy Abrams "All's Well that Ends Well" from album *Alien Wisdom* 

![](_page_40_Figure_0.jpeg)

Fumagalli, Prochaska, Kasen, Dekel, Ceverino, & Primack 2011

#### What's the effect of including dust?

with dust

Dramatic effects on -Appearance -Half-mass radii (bigger with dust) -Sersic index (lower with dust)

![](_page_41_Picture_3.jpeg)

stars only

![](_page_41_Picture_5.jpeg)

## Ceverino+VL6 Cosmological Zoom-in Simulation

Face-On

Edge-On

![](_page_42_Figure_3.jpeg)

**Chris Moody** 

#### The CANDELS Survey with new near-ir camera WFC3 GALAXIES ~10 BILLION YEARS AGO

![](_page_43_Figure_1.jpeg)

CANDELS makes use of the near-infrared WFC3 camera (top row) and the visible-light ACS camera (bottom row). Using these two cameras, CANDELS will reveal new details of the distant Universe and test the reality of cosmic dark energy.

![](_page_43_Picture_3.jpeg)

#### http://candels.ucolick.org

CANDELS is a powerful imaging survey of the distant Universe being carried out with two cameras on board the Hubble Space Telescope.

- CANDELS is the largest project in the history of Hubble, with 902 assigned orbits of observing time. This
  is the equivalent of four months of Hubble time if executed consecutively, but in practice CANDELS will
  take three years to complete (2010-2013).
- The core of CANDELS is the revolutionary near-infrared WFC3 camera, installed on Hubble in May 2009. WFC3 is sensitive to longer, redder wavelengths, which permits it to follow the stretching of lightwaves caused by the expanding Universe. This enables CANDELS to detect and measure objects much farther out in space and nearer to the Big Bang than before. CANDELS also uses the visible-light ACS camera, and together the two cameras give unprecedented panchromatic coverage of galaxies from optical wavelengths to the near-IR.

Simulated Galaxy 10 billion years ago as it would appear nearby to our eyes edge-on face-on z ٧ z V as it would appear to Hubble's ACS visual camera Н H а as it would appear to Hubble's new WFC3 infrared camera

Our Simulations w/ Dust look a lot like galaxies from 10 billion years ago that we see with Hubble Space Telescope

![](_page_45_Figure_1.jpeg)

Our Simulations w/ Dust look a lot like galaxies from 10 billion years ago that we see with Hubble Space Telescope

![](_page_46_Figure_1.jpeg)

We are now systematically comparing simulated and observed galaxy images

## The Angular Momentum Catastrophe

In practice it is not trivial to form galaxies with massive, extended disks and small spheroids. The angular momentum content of the disk determines its final structure.

![](_page_47_Figure_2.jpeg)

## The Angular Momentum Catastrophe

In practice it is not trivial to form galaxies with massive, extended disks and small spheroids. The angular momentum content of the disk determines its final structure. None of the 2012 Aquila low-resolution galaxy simulations had realistic disks.

#### fraction

![](_page_48_Figure_3.jpeg)

![](_page_48_Picture_4.jpeg)

#### Scannapieco et al., Aquila Galaxy Simulation Comparison, 2012

## The Angular Momentum Catastrophe

Eris, the first high-resolution simulation of a ~10<sup>12</sup> M<sub> $\odot$ </sub> halo, produced a realistic spiral galaxy. Adequate resolution and physically realistic feedback appear to be sufficient.

![](_page_49_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_49_Picture_3.jpeg)

Guedes, Callegari, Madau, Mayer 2011 ApJ

University of California High-Performance AstroComputing Center (UC-HiPACC) Joel Primack, Director

![](_page_50_Picture_1.jpeg)

University of California Santa Cruz Next Telescope Science Institute (NEXSI) Piero Madau, Director

**Assembling Galaxies of Resolved Anatomy AGORA High-Resolution Galaxy Simulation Comparison Project Steering Committee** Piero Madau & Joel R. Primack, UCSC, Co-Chairs **Tom Abel, Stanford** Nick Gnedin, Chicago/Fermilab Lucio Mayer, Unive urich **Romain Teyssier**, urich **James Wadsle** Ji-hoon Kim, UCS ator) ~90 astrophysicists using 9 codes have joined AGORA Next meeting: after UCSC Galaxy Workshop Aug 16-19, 2013

www.AGORAsimulations.org

**AGORA High-Resolution Simulation Comparison** 

Initial Conditions for Simulations

MUSIC galaxy masses at z~0: ~10<sup>10</sup>, 10<sup>11</sup>, 10<sup>12</sup>, 10<sup>13</sup> M<sub>☉</sub>
 with both quiet and busy merging trees
 isolation criteria agreed for Lagrangian regions
 Isolated Spiral Galaxy at z~1: ~10<sup>12</sup> M<sub>☉</sub>

Astrophysics that all groups will include UV background (Haardt-Madau 2012) cooling function (based on ENZO and Eris cooling)

Tools to compare simulations based on yt, to be available for all codes used in AGORA

Images and SEDs for all timesteps from yt sunrise

www.AGORAsimulations.org

#### www.AGORAsimulations.org

#### AGORA Task-Oriented Working Groups

	Working Group	Objectives and Tasks
T1	Common Astrophysics	UV background, metal-dependent cooling, IMF, metal yields
T2	ICs: Isolated	common initial conditions for isolated low- $z$ disk galaxies
T3	ICs: Cosmological	common initial conditions for cosmological zoom-in simulations
		support yt and other analysis tools, define quantitative
T4	Common Analysis	and physically meaningful comparisons across simulations

#### AGORA Science Working Groups

	Working Group	Science Questions (includes, but not limited to)
S1	Isolated Galaxies and Subgrid Physics	tune the subgrid physics across platforms to produce similar results for similar astrophysical assumptions
S2	Dwarf Galaxies	simulate $\sim 10^{10} M_{\odot}$ halos, compare results across all platforms
S3	Dark Matter	radial profile, shape, substructure, core-cusp problem
S4	Satellite Galaxies	effects of environment, UV background, tidal disruption
S5	Galactic Characteristics	surface brightness, stellar properties, metallicity, images, SEDs
S6	Outflows	outflows, circumgalactic medium, metal absorption systems
S7	High-redshift Galaxies	cold flows, clumpiness, kinematics, Lyman-limit systems
S8	Interstellar Medium	galactic interstellar medium, thermodynamics
S9	Massive Black Holes	black hole growth and feedback in galactic context
S10	$\begin{array}{c} \text{Ly}\alpha \text{ Absorption} \\ \text{and Emission} \end{array}$	prediction of $Ly\alpha$ maps for simulated galaxies and their environments including effects of radiative transfer

## AGORA High-Resolution Galaxy Simulation Comparison Project: Calendar

AGORA Kickoff Meeting: August 17-18-19, 2012, at UCSC

Roughly every four months: AGORA SeeVogh web conference First web conf. Nov. 16, 2012; next April 26, 2013; ...

yt Developers Workshop: UCSC March 6-8

AGORA Flagship Paper to be submitted: June 30

Summer 2013: UC-HiPACC Summer School on Star and Planet Formation July 22 - August 9, at UCSC, directed by Mark Krumholz Santa Cruz Galaxy Workshop - August 12-16 (by invitation contact Avishai Dekel or Joel Primack)

AGORA Conference August 16-19 at UCSC

#### **Cosmic 3D Questions**

Milky Way Meets Andromeda Our galactic future?

![](_page_54_Picture_2.jpeg)

Milky Way's Universe Special Environment ?

#### Ways of Showing 3D

Milky Way Meets Andromeda Extreme Perspective

![](_page_55_Picture_2.jpeg)

Milky Way's Universe Comoving Evolution, Fly-through

![](_page_56_Picture_0.jpeg)

#### Astro-Computation Visualization and Outreach

Project lead: Prof. Joel Primack, Director, UC High-Performance AstroComputing Center UC-HIPACC Visualization and Outreach Specialist: Nina McCurdy

![](_page_56_Picture_3.jpeg)

![](_page_56_Picture_4.jpeg)

![](_page_56_Picture_5.jpeg)

![](_page_56_Picture_6.jpeg)

HIPACC is working with the Morrison Planetarium at the California Academy of Sciences (pictured here) to show how dark matter shapes the universe. We helped prepare their show *LIFE: a Cosmic Story* that opened in fall 2010, and also a major planetarium show that opened the new 8000 pixel across Adler Planetarium Grainger Sky Theater in July 2011.

## zSpace Holographic Workstation

![](_page_57_Picture_1.jpeg)

zSpace, a Silicon Valley startup, has given their technology to the UCSC 3D Vizualization Laboratory (3D VizLab)

## Current zSpace Projects

![](_page_58_Picture_1.jpeg)

Dark Matter Halos in the Cosmic Web

![](_page_58_Picture_3.jpeg)

Galaxy Formation & Evolution

![](_page_58_Picture_5.jpeg)

Dwarf Galaxies & Gas Collection

![](_page_58_Picture_7.jpeg)

The Epicyclic Motion of Galactic Stars

#### AstroComputing is Prototypical Scientific Computing

Astronomy has several advantages:

The data tends to be pretty clean

The data is (mostly) non-proprietary

The research is (mostly) funded

The data is pretty sexy

There's a lot of public involvement:

![](_page_59_Picture_7.jpeg)

# **Big Challenges of AstroComputing**

**Big Data** 

Sloan Digital Sky Survey (SDSS) 2008 2.5 Terapixels of images 40 TB raw data ➡120 TB processed 35 TB catalogs

Mikulski Archive for Space Telescopes

185 TB of images (MAST) 2013
25 TB/year ingest rate
>100 TB/year retrieval rate

#### Large Synoptic Survey Telescope (LSST)

15 TB per night for 10 years2019100 PB image archive20 PB final database catalog

#### Square Kilometer Array (SKA) ~2024

1 EB per day (~ internet traffic today) 100 PFlop/s processing power

~1 EB processed data/year

![](_page_60_Figure_10.jpeg)

Increasingly inhomogeneous computers are harder to program! We need computational scientists and engineers and new compilers that generate code for nodes with cores+accelerators with automatic load balancing and fault tolerance.

## **The Big Data Future in Astronomy**

Exponential growth in computing power and detectors and falling cost of data storage has enabled vast increases in

- Ambitious surveys, with massive storage for archives
- Simulation realism virtual experiments on the universe

Astronomy is becoming dominated by surveys and simulations

- How can we understand such huge amounts of data? We need data microscopes and telescopes!

We have to analyze outputs as the supercomputers run

- Users will send questions (algorithms) to where the data is stored and get back answers including visualizations (not raw data)

#### **High Performance Scientific Computing Needs**

The challenges facing us are

"Big data" -- too large to move -- from more powerful observations, larger computer outputs, and falling storage costs

Changing high-performance computer architecture -from networked single processors to multicore and GPUs

These challenges demand new collaborations between natural scientists and computer scientists to develop

Tools and scientific programmers to convert legacy code and write new codes efficient on multicore/GPU architectures, including fault tolerance and automatic load balancing

New ways to visualize and analyze big data remotely

Train new generations of scientific computer users

Improve education and outreach

UC-HiPACC is proposing a California Scientific Computing Institute in Silicon Valley to work on these issues -- we welcome collaboration!

## **Supercomputing the Universe** Joel R. Primack, UCSC

http://scipp.ucsc.edu/personnel/profiles/primack.html

Websites related to this talk:

http://hipacc.ucsc.edu/v4/ International Astronomy Visualization Gallery http://hipacc.ucsc.edu/v4/ International Astronomy Visualization Gallery http://hipacc.ucsc.edu/Bolshoi Bolshoi simulations http://candels.ucolick.org CANDELS survey http://code.google.com/p/sunrise/ Sunrise dust code

#### Abrams & Primack Book Websites with images and videos:

![](_page_63_Picture_5.jpeg)

New-Universe.org

![](_page_63_Picture_7.jpeg)

THE NEW UNIVERSE AND THE HUMAN FUTURE

NANCY ELLEN ABRAMS AND JOEL R. PRIMACK

![](_page_63_Picture_10.jpeg)

![](_page_63_Picture_11.jpeg)